

# Finite $p$ -Groups and Normal Closures of Nonnormal Subgroups

Junqiang ZHANG\*, Ruijiao LU, Wentian LI

*Department of Mathematics, Shanxi Normal University, Shanxi 041004, P. R. China*

**Abstract** In this paper, finite  $p$ -groups  $G$  with  $G/H^G$  being cyclic for every minimal non-normal subgroup  $H$  are classified up to isomorphism, where  $H^G$  denotes the normal closure of  $H$ .

**Keywords** nonnormal subgroups; normal closures; Dedekindian  $p$ -groups

**MR(2010) Subject Classification** 20D10; 20D15

## 1. Introduction

In this paper, all groups considered are finite groups. Let  $G$  be a finite group. Given a nonempty subset  $H$  of  $G$ , the normal closure of  $H$  in  $G$  is the intersection of all normal subgroups of  $G$  which contain  $H$ , it is denoted by  $H^G$ . Obviously,  $H^G$  is the smallest normal subgroup containing  $H$  and it is easy to show that  $H^G = \langle h^g | h \in H, g \in G \rangle$ . If  $H$  is a subgroup of  $G$ , we notice that  $H \leq H^G \leq G$  and

$$H = H^G \text{ if and only if } H \trianglelefteq G.$$

Thus a subgroup may be regarded as “far normal” if it has “large” normal closure or “nearly normal” if it has “small” normal closure. Finite  $p$ -groups with “small” normal closure have been investigated in [1–3], respectively. On the other hand, finite  $p$ -groups with “large” normal closure have also been investigated. For example, Janko [4] classified finite  $p$ -groups  $G$  such that  $|G : H^G| = p$  for every nonnormal subgroup  $H$  of  $G$ . Zhao and Guo [5] classified finite  $p$ -groups  $G$  such that  $|G : H^G| \leq p^2$  for every nonnormal cyclic subgroup  $H$  of  $G$ . As a continuation of Janko, Zhao and Guo’s works, we classify finite  $p$ -groups such that  $G/H^G$  is cyclic for every nonnormal subgroup  $H$  of  $G$  in this paper.

For convenience, a finite  $p$ -group  $G$  is called a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group if  $G/H^G$  is cyclic for every minimal nonnormal subgroup  $H$ .

In Lemma 2.4, we give some equivalent conditions for a finite  $p$ -group  $G$  to be a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group. It turns out that  $G$  is a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group if and only if every nonnormal subgroup of  $G$  is contained in exactly one maximal subgroup of  $G$ . In [6], Janko gave a classification of such finite  $p$ -groups.

---

Received October 6, 2014; Accepted May 25, 2015

Supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Grant Nos. 11371232; 11226048; 11401355) and the Natural Science Foundation of Shanxi Province (Grant No. 2013011001-1).

\* Corresponding author

E-mail address: junqiangchang@163.com (Junqiang ZHANG)

Hence  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -groups are classified. This paper will give an independent proof of this classification by using central extension. In Theorem 3.1,  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -groups will be classified up to isomorphism and more detail information of  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -groups will be given.

Throughout this paper,  $p$  is always a prime. Let  $G$  be a finite  $p$ -group. The  $n$ th term of the lower central series of  $G$  is denoted by  $G_n$  and  $G' = G_2$ . We use  $c(G)$ ,  $\exp(G)$  and  $d(G)$  to denote the nilpotency class, the exponent and the minimal number of generators of  $G$  respectively.  $o(g)$  denotes the order of  $g$ , and  $M < G$  denotes that  $M$  is a maximal subgroup of  $G$ . We also use  $C_{p^n}$  and  $E_{p^n}$  to denote the cyclic group and the elementary abelian group of order  $p^n$ , respectively, where  $C_{p^0} = E_{p^0} = 1$ .

We also use the following notation.

$$\Omega_1(G) = \langle g \in G \mid g^p = 1 \rangle \text{ and } \mathcal{U}_1(G) = \langle g^p \mid g \in G \rangle.$$

$$M_p(n, m) = \langle a, b \mid a^{p^n} = b^{p^m} = 1, a^b = a^{1+p^{n-1}} \rangle, \text{ where } n \geq 2.$$

$$M_p(n, m, 1) = \langle a, b, c \mid a^{p^n} = b^{p^m} = c^p = 1, [a, b] = c, [c, a] = [c, b] = 1 \rangle,$$

where  $n \geq m$ , and  $m + n \geq 3$  if  $p = 2$ .

The other terminology and notations are standard, as in [7].

## 2. Preliminaries

A nonabelian  $p$ -group is said to be minimal nonabelian if all its proper subgroups are abelian. A  $p$ -group is said to be Dedekindian if all its subgroups are normal.

**Lemma 2.1** ([8]) *Let  $G$  be a minimal nonabelian  $p$ -group. Then  $G$  is  $Q_8$ ,  $M_p(m, n)$ , or  $M_p(m, n, 1)$ .*

**Lemma 2.2** ([9, Theorem 1.1]) *If  $G$  is Dedekindian, then  $G$  is either abelian or  $G \cong Q_8 \times E_{2^n}$ .*

**Lemma 2.3** *Let  $G$  be a finite  $p$ -group. If  $|G'| \geq p^2$ , then there exists  $N \trianglelefteq G$  such that  $G/N$  is not a Dedekindian group, where  $N \leq G' \cap Z(G)$  and  $|K| = p$ .*

**Proof** Since  $|G'| \geq p^2$ ,  $G$  is not Dedekindian. By [9, Lemma 2.1], there exists  $K \trianglelefteq G$  such that  $|G' : K| = p$  and  $G/K$  is not Dedekindian. Thus there exists  $N \leq K \cap Z(G) \leq G' \cap Z(G)$  such that  $|N| = p$ . Since  $G/K \cong (G/N)/(K/N)$ ,  $G/N$  is not Dedekindian.  $\square$

A minimal nonnormal subgroup of a finite group  $G$  is a nonnormal subgroup whose proper subgroups are normal in  $G$ . We have the following

**Lemma 2.4** *Let  $G$  be a finite  $p$ -group which is not Dedekindian. Then the following statements are equivalent.*

- (1) *The factor group  $G/H^G$  is cyclic for every minimal nonnormal subgroup  $H$  of  $G$ .*
- (2) *The factor group  $G/H^G$  is cyclic for every nonnormal subgroup  $H$  of  $G$ .*
- (3) *Every subgroup of  $\Phi(G)$  is normal in  $G$  and  $d(G) = 2$ .*
- (4) *Every nonnormal subgroup is contained in exactly one maximal subgroup of  $G$ .*

**Proof** (1) $\Rightarrow$ (2). Let  $H$  be a nonnormal subgroup of  $G$ . Then there exists  $L \leq H$  such that  $L$  is a minimal nonnormal subgroup of  $G$ . Thus  $G/L^G$  is cyclic. It follows that  $G/H^G$  is cyclic.

(2) $\Rightarrow$ (3). Let  $H \leq \Phi(G)$ . Then  $H^G \leq \Phi(G)$ . Since  $G/\Phi(G)$  is not cyclic,  $G/H^G$  is not cyclic. It follows that  $H \trianglelefteq G$ . Thus every subgroup of  $\Phi(G)$  is normal in  $G$ .

Let  $H$  be a minimal nonnormal subgroup of  $G$ . By [9, Lemma 1.4],  $H$  is cyclic. Let  $H = \langle a \rangle$ . Since  $H^G \leq HG'$  and  $G/H^G$  is cyclic,  $G/HG'$  is cyclic. Let  $G/HG' = \langle \bar{b} \rangle$ . Then  $G = \langle a, b, G' \rangle = \langle a, b \rangle$ . Thus  $d(G) = 2$ .

(3) $\Rightarrow$ (4). Since  $d(G) = 2$ ,  $M_1 \cap M_2 = \Phi(G)$  for any two distinct maximal subgroups  $M_1$  and  $M_2$  of  $G$ . If  $H \leq M_1 \cap M_2 = \Phi(G)$ , then  $H \trianglelefteq G$ . It follows that (4) holds.

(4) $\Rightarrow$ (1). Let  $H$  be a minimal nonnormal subgroup of  $G$ . Then  $H$  is contained in exactly one maximal subgroup of  $G$ . It follows that  $H\Phi(G)$  is contained in exactly one maximal subgroup of  $G$ . Hence  $G/H\Phi(G)$  is of order  $p$  by correspondence theorem. Let  $G/H\Phi(G) = \langle \bar{a} \rangle$ . Then  $G = \langle a, H, \Phi(G) \rangle = \langle a \rangle H^G$ . Thus  $G/H^G = \langle \bar{a} \rangle$ . (1) holds.  $\square$

**Lemma 2.5** *Let  $G$  be a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group. Then the following statements hold.*

- (1) *If  $N \trianglelefteq G$ , then  $G/N$  is a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group.*
- (2) *The derived subgroup  $G'$  is cyclic.*
- (3) *If  $H \leq \Phi(G)$  and  $H \cap G' = 1$ , then  $H \leq Z(G)$ .*

**Proof** (1) Let  $\bar{G} = G/N$  and  $\bar{H} = H/N \not\trianglelefteq \bar{G}$ . Then  $H \not\trianglelefteq G$ . Notice that  $\bar{G}/(\bar{H}^{\bar{G}}) = \bar{G}/\bar{H}^{\bar{G}} \cong G/H^G$ . Since  $G$  is a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group,  $\bar{G}$  is a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group.

(2) Since  $G$  is a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group,  $d(G) = 2$  by Lemma 2.4(3). Let  $G = \langle a, b \rangle$ . Then  $G' = \langle [a, b]^g \mid g \in G \rangle$ . Since  $\langle [a, b] \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ ,  $\langle [a, b] \rangle \trianglelefteq G$  by Lemma 2.4(3). It follows that  $G' = \langle [a, b] \rangle$ .

(3) If  $H \leq \Phi(G)$ , then  $H \trianglelefteq G$  by Lemma 2.4(3). It follows that  $[H, G'] \leq H \cap G' = 1$ . Thus  $H \leq Z(G)$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 2.6** *Let  $G$  be a finite  $p$ -group. Then  $G$  is a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group if  $G$  is one of following groups.*

- (1)  *$G$  is a 2-group of maximal class.*
- (2)  *$G$  is a minimal nonabelian  $p$ -group.*

**Proof** (1) Let  $H$  be a nonnormal subgroup of  $G$ . Since  $G$  is a 2-group of maximal class,  $G_i$  is the unique normal subgroup of order  $2^{n-i}$ . It follows that  $H^G = G_i$  or a maximal subgroup of  $G$ . If  $H^G = G_i$ , which is cyclic, then  $H \text{ char } G_i \triangleleft G$ . It follows that  $H \triangleleft G$ , a contradiction. Thus  $H^G$  is a maximal subgroup of  $G$  and so  $G/H^G$  is cyclic. It follows that  $G$  is a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group.

(2) Let  $H$  be a nonnormal subgroup of  $G$ . Notice that  $G$  is a minimal nonabelian  $p$ -group, we get  $d(G) = 2$ ,  $|G'| = p$  and  $Z(G) = \Phi(G)$ . It follows that  $H \not\leq \Phi(G)$  and  $H\Phi(G)$  is of index at most  $p$ . Since  $H$  is not normal in  $G$ ,  $H < H^G \leq HG'$  and  $|HG' : H| = p$ . Thus  $H^G = HG'$ . Let  $\bar{G} = G/H^G$ . Then

$$|\bar{G}/\Phi(\bar{G})| = |\bar{G}/\overline{\Phi(G)}| = |G/\Phi(G)H| = p.$$

It follows that  $G/H^G$  is cyclic. So  $G$  is a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group.  $\square$

### 3. The main results and their proofs

If all subgroups of  $G$  are normal, then  $G$  is a Dedekindian group. The groups have been classified. Thus we consider the  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -groups with nonnormal subgroups in this section.

**Theorem 3.1** *Let  $G$  be a finite  $p$ -group with nonnormal subgroups. Then  $G$  is a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group if and only if one of the following occurs.*

I.  $M_p(n, m)$  or  $M_p(n, m, 1)$ .

II. 2-groups of maximal class of order  $\geq 2^4$ .

III. Nonmetacyclic 2-groups of order  $2^{n+2}$ , where  $n \geq 3$ .

(1)  $\langle a, b, c \mid a^{2^n} = b^2 = 1, [a, b] = c, c^2 = a^{-4}, [c, a] = 1, [c, b] = c^{-2} \rangle$ .

(2)  $\langle a, b, c \mid a^{2^n} = 1, b^2 = a^{2^{n-1}}, [a, b] = c, c^2 = a^{-4}, [c, a] = 1, [c, b] = c^{-2} \rangle$ .

In groups (1) and (2) of III,  $G' = \langle c \rangle \cong C_{2^{n-1}}, \Phi(G) = \langle a^2 \rangle \times \langle a^2c \rangle \cong C_{2^{n-1}} \times C_2, Z(G) = \langle a^{2^{n-1}} \rangle \times \langle a^2c \rangle \cong C_2^2$ .

(3)  $\langle a, b, c \mid a^{2^n} = b^4 = 1, [a, b] = c, c^2 = a^{-4}, [c, a] = 1, [c, b] = c^{-2} \rangle$ , where  $G' = \langle c \rangle \cong C_{2^{n-1}}, \Phi(G) = \langle a^2 \rangle \times \langle a^2c \rangle \times \langle b^2 \rangle \cong C_{2^{n-1}} \times C_2 \times C_2, Z(G) = \langle a^{2^{n-1}} \rangle \times \langle a^2c \rangle \times \langle b^2 \rangle \cong C_2^3$ .

IV. Metacyclic 2-groups of order  $2^{n+2}$ , where  $n \geq 3$ .

(1)  $\langle a, b \mid a^{2^n} = b^4 = 1, [a, b] = a^{-2} \rangle$ .

(2)  $\langle a, b \mid a^{2^n} = b^4 = 1, [a, b] = a^{-2+2^{n-1}} \rangle$ .

In groups (1) and (2) of IV,  $G' = \langle a^2 \rangle \cong C_{2^{n-1}}, \Phi(G) = \langle a^2 \rangle \times \langle b^2 \rangle \cong C_{2^{n-1}} \times C_2, Z(G) = \langle a^{2^{n-1}} \rangle \times \langle b^2 \rangle \cong C_2^2$ .

**Proof** Let  $G$  be a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group with nonnormal subgroups. By Lemma 2.4(3), every subgroup of  $\Phi(G)$  is normal in  $G$  and  $d(G) = 2$ . If  $p > 2$ , then  $\Phi(G) \leq Z(G)$  by [7, §4, Exercise 8]. It follows that  $G$  is a minimal nonabelian  $p$ -group. Since  $G$  has nonnormal subgroups,  $G$  is not Dedekindian. By Lemma 2.1, we get  $G$  is isomorphic to  $M_p(n, m)$  or  $M_p(n, m, 1)$ .

Next, we complete the proof by induction on  $|G'|$  for  $p = 2$ . Assume  $|G'| = 2$ . By Lemma 2.4(3), we get  $d(G) = 2$ . It follows that  $G$  is a minimal nonabelian  $p$ -group. By Lemma 2.1, group  $G$  is  $M_p(n, m)$  or  $M_p(n, m, 1)$ . Assume  $|G'| \geq 2^2$ . Then there exists a normal subgroup  $N$  of order 2 of  $G$  such that  $N \leq G' \cap Z(G)$ . Let  $\bar{G} = G/N$ . Then  $\bar{G}$  is a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group by Lemma 2.5(1),  $\bar{G}$  has nonnormal subgroups by Lemma 2.3 and  $|\bar{G}'| < |G'|$ . By induction,  $\bar{G}$  is one of groups of Theorem.

**Case 1**  $\bar{G}$  is a 2-group of maximal class or  $\bar{G} \cong M_p(n, 1)$ , where  $n \geq 2$ .

Let  $\bar{G} = \langle \bar{a}, \bar{b} \rangle$  and  $N = \langle x \rangle$ . Then  $G$  is metacyclic by [10, Theorem 1]. Thus  $N = \langle a^{2^n} \rangle$  and  $G = \langle a, b \rangle$ . It follows that  $\langle a \rangle$  is a cyclic maximal subgroup of  $G$ . Since  $|G'| \geq p^2$ ,  $G$  is a 2-group of maximal class by [7, Theorem 1.2]. Thus  $G$  is one of groups of type II.

**Case 2**  $\bar{G} \cong M_p(n, m)$ , where  $n, m \geq 2$ .

Let  $\bar{G} = \langle \bar{a}, \bar{b} \mid \bar{a}^{2^n} = \bar{b}^{2^m} = \bar{1}, [\bar{a}, \bar{b}] = \bar{a}^{2^{n-1}} \rangle$  and  $N = \langle x \rangle$ . Then  $G$  is metacyclic by [10, Theorem 1]. Thus  $N = \langle a^{2^n} \rangle$  and  $G = \langle a, b \rangle$  with relations

$$a^{2^{n+1}} = 1, b^{2^m} = a^{j2^n}, [a, b] = a^{2^{n-1}+k2^n},$$

where  $j, k \in \{0, 1\}$ .

We can assume that  $j = 0$ . In fact, if  $j = 1$  and  $m \geq n$ , then  $(b^{-2^{m-n+1}} \cdot a^2)^{2^{n-1}} = b^{-2^m} \cdot a^{2^n} = 1$ . It follows that  $\langle b^{-2^{m-n+1}} \cdot a^2 \rangle \cap G' = 1$ . Notice that  $a^2 \notin Z(G)$ , then  $b^{-2^{m-n+1}} \cdot a^2 \notin Z(G)$ . Hence  $\langle b^{-2^{m-n+1}} \cdot a^2 \rangle \not\leq G$ . This contradicts Lemma 2.4(3). It follows that  $m < n$  if  $j = 1$ . Since  $m \geq 2, n \geq 3$ . Let  $b_1 = ba^{-2^{n-m}}$ . Then  $b_1^{2^m} = 1$ . So we can assume that  $j = 0$ .

Since  $\langle b^2 \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ , by Lemma 2.4(3), we get  $\langle b^2 \rangle \leq G$ . Notice that  $\langle b^2 \rangle \cap G' = 1$ , then  $[a, b^2] = 1$ . Thus

$$1 = [a, b^2] = [a, b]^2 [a, b, b] = a^{2^n} [a^{2^{n-1}}, b] = a^{2^n} [a, b]^{2^{n-1}} = a^{2^n} a^{2^{2n-2}}.$$

It follows that  $n - 2 \equiv 0 \pmod{n + 1}$ , which implies that  $n = 2$ .

If  $m \geq 3$ , then  $(a^2 b^{2^{m-2}})^2 = (a^{2^2} b^{2^{m-1}})^2 = a^{2^3} b^{2^m} = 1$ . It follows that  $\langle a^2 b^{2^{m-2}} \rangle \cap G' = 1$ . Notice that  $a^2 \notin Z(G)$ , then  $a^2 b^{2^{m-2}} \notin Z(G)$ . Hence  $\langle a^2 b^{2^{m-2}} \rangle \not\leq G$ . This contradicts Lemma 2.4(3). It follows that  $m = 2$ .

Now  $G$  is one of groups of IV(1) or IV(2).

**Case 3**  $\bar{G} \cong M_2(n, m, 1)$ , where  $n \geq m$  and  $m + n \geq 3$ .

Let  $\bar{G} = \langle \bar{a}, \bar{b}, \bar{c} \mid \bar{a}^{2^n} = \bar{b}^{2^m} = \bar{c}^2 = \bar{1}, [\bar{a}, \bar{b}] = \bar{c}, [\bar{a}, \bar{c}] = [\bar{b}, \bar{c}] = \bar{1} \rangle$ . By Lemma 2.5(2), we get  $G'$  is cyclic. It follows that  $N = \langle c^2 \rangle$ . Thus

$$G = \langle a, b, c \mid a^{2^n} = c^{i2}, b^{2^m} = c^{j2}, c^{2^2} = 1, [a, b] = c^{1+k2}, [a, c] = c^{s2}, [b, c] = c^{t2} \rangle,$$

where  $i, j, k, s, t \in \{0, 1\}$ .

We can assume  $k = 0$  by letting  $c_1 = c^{1+k2}$ .

We may assume  $s = 0$ , that is,  $[a, c] = 1$ . If  $st = 0$ , without loss of generality, we can let  $s = 0$ . If  $st = 1$ , letting  $a_1 = ab$ , then  $[a_1, c] = [a, c][b, c] = c^4 = 1$ . Thus we can assume that  $s = 0$ .

Since  $[a^2, b] = [a, b]^2 = c^2 \neq 1, a^2 \notin Z(G)$ . It follows that  $n \geq 2$ . Notice that  $\langle a^2 \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ , by Lemma 2.4(3),  $\langle a^2 \rangle \leq G$ . Thus  $[a^2, b] = c^2 \in \langle a^2 \rangle$ . It follows that  $i = 1$ .

If  $t = 0$ , that is  $[b, c] = 1$ , then  $[a, b^2] = [a, b]^2 = c^2$ . Thus  $b^2 \notin Z(G)$ . It follows that  $m \geq 2$ . Since  $\langle b^2 \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ , by Lemma 2.5(3), we can get  $j = 1$ . If  $n \geq m$ , then  $(b^2 a^{2^{n-m+1}})^{2^{m-1}} = b^{2^m} a^{2^n} = 1$ . It follows that  $\langle b^2 a^{2^{n-m+1}} \rangle \cap G' = 1$ . Notice that  $\langle b^2 a^{2^{n-m+1}} \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ , then  $\langle b^2 a^{2^{n-m+1}} \rangle \leq Z(G)$ , which contradicts that  $[b^2 a^{2^{n-m+1}}, a] = [b^2, a] = c^2 \neq 1$ . If  $m \geq n$ , consider  $\langle a^2 b^{2^{m-n+1}} \rangle$ , we can get a contradiction too. Thus  $t = 1$ .

Since  $(a^{2^{n-1}} c)^2 = a^{2^n} c^2 = c^4 = 1, \langle a^{2^{n-1}} c \rangle \cap G' = 1$ . Notice that  $\langle a^{2^{n-1}} c \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ , then  $\langle a^{2^{n-1}} c \rangle \leq Z(G)$ . It follows that

$$1 = [a^{2^{n-1}} c, b] = [a, b]^{2^{n-1}} [c, b] = c^{2^{n-1}} c^2 = c^{2(1+2^{n-2})}.$$

We obtain that  $t + 2^{n-2} \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$ . Thus  $n = 2$ .

We assert that  $m \leq 2$ . Otherwise, if  $m \geq 3$ , then  $a^2 b^{2^{m-1}}, a^2 b^{2^{m-2}} \in \Phi(G) - Z(G)$ . By Lemma 2.5(3), we can get  $\langle a^2 b^{2^{m-1}} \rangle \cap G' \neq 1$  and  $\langle a^2 b^{2^{m-2}} \rangle \cap G' \neq 1$ . If  $j = 1$ , then  $(a^2 b^{2^{m-1}})^2 = 1$ . It follows that  $\langle a^2 b^{2^{m-1}} \rangle \cap G' = 1$ , a contradiction. If  $j = 0$ , then  $(a^2 b^{2^{m-2}})^2 = (a^2 b^{2^{m-1}})^2 = 1$ . It follows that  $\langle a^2 b^{2^{m-2}} \rangle \cap G' = 1$ , a contradiction too. Thus  $m \leq 2$ .

If  $m = 1$ , then  $G$  is one of groups III(1) or (2).

If  $m = 2$ , we can get  $j = 0$ . If  $j = 1$ , then  $\langle b^2c \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$  and  $\langle b^2c \rangle \not\leq Z(G)$ . By Lemma 2.5(3), we can get  $\langle b^2c \rangle \cap G' \neq 1$ . Since  $(b^2c)^2 = b^4c^2 = 1$ ,  $\langle b^2c \rangle \cap G' = 1$ , a contradiction. Thus  $j = 0$  if  $m = 2$ , and  $G$  is one of groups III(3).

**Case 4**  $\bar{G}$  is one of groups III(1) of Theorem.

Let  $\bar{G} = \langle \bar{a}, \bar{b} \mid \bar{a}^{2^n} = 1, \bar{b}^2 = 1, [\bar{a}, \bar{b}] = \bar{c}, \bar{c}^2 = \bar{a}^{-4}, [\bar{c}, \bar{a}] = 1, [\bar{c}, \bar{b}] = \bar{c}^{-2} \rangle$  and  $N = \langle x \rangle$ . Then

$$G = \langle a, b \mid a^{2^n} = x^i, b^2 = x^j, [a, b] = cx^k, c^2 = a^{-4}x^l, [c, a] = x^s, [c, b] = c^{-2}x^t \rangle,$$

where  $i, j, k, l, s, t \in \{0, 1\}$ .

By Lemma 2.5(2),  $G'$  is cyclic. It follows that  $G' = \langle c \rangle$  and  $N = \langle c^{2^{n-1}} \rangle$ . If  $a^{2^n} = 1$ , notice that  $n \geq 3$ , then  $1 = (a^{-4}x^l)^{2^{n-2}} = (c^2)^{2^{n-2}} = c^{2^{n-1}}$ , a contradiction. Thus  $i = 1$ . Since  $b^2 \in N \leq Z(G)$ , by computation, we get  $1 = [a, b^2] = [a, b]^2[a, b] = c^2c^{-2}x^t = x^t$ . Thus  $t = 0$ . We can assume  $k = 0$  by letting  $c_1 = cx^k$ . It follows that

$$G = \langle a, b \mid a^{2^{n+1}} = 1, b^2 = c^{j2^{n-1}}, [a, b] = c, c^2 = a^{-4}c^{l2^{n-1}}, [c, a] = c^{s2^{n-1}}, [c, b] = c^{-2} \rangle,$$

where  $j, l, s \in \{0, 1\}$ .

If  $s = 1$ , then

$$(c^{1+l2^{n-2}}a^2)^2 = c^2c^{l2^{n-1}}a^4 = a^{-4}c^{l2^{n-1}}c^{l2^{n-1}}a^4 = 1.$$

It follows that  $\langle c^{1+l2^{n-2}}a \rangle \cap G' = 1$ . Notice that  $\langle c^{1+l2^{n-2}}a \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ , by Lemma 2.5(3), we get  $\langle c^{1+l2^{n-2}}a \rangle \leq Z(G)$ . Since  $n \geq 3$  and  $[c, a] \in Z(G)$ , by computation, we get  $[c^{1+l2^{n-2}}a^2, a] = [c^{1+l2^{n-2}}, a] = [c, a] = c^{s2^{n-1}} \neq 1$ , a contradiction. Thus  $s = 0$ .

If  $l = 1$ , then  $(ca^{2^{-2^{n-1}}})^2 = c^2a^{2^{-2^n}} = 1$ . It follows that  $\langle ca^{2^{-2^{n-1}}} \rangle \cap G' = 1$ . Notice that  $\langle ca^{2^{-2^{n-1}}} \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ , by Lemma 2.5(3),  $\langle ca^{2^{-2^{n-1}}} \rangle \leq Z(G)$ . Since  $n \geq 3$  and  $[c, a] = 1$ , by computation, we get

$$[ca^{2^{-2^{n-1}}}, b] = [c, b][a^{2^{-2^{n-1}}}, b] = c^{-2}[a^2, b][a^{-2^{n-1}}, b] = c^{-2}[a, b]^2[a, b, a][a, b]^{-2^{n-1}} = c^{-2^{n-1}} \neq 1,$$

a contradiction. Thus  $l = 0$ .

If  $j = 0$ , then  $G$  is one of groups III(1). If  $j = 1$ , then  $G$  is one of groups III(2).

**Case 5**  $\bar{G}$  is one of groups III(2) of Theorem.

Let  $\bar{G} = \langle \bar{a}, \bar{b} \mid \bar{a}^{2^n} = 1, \bar{b}^2 = \bar{a}^{2^{n-1}}, [\bar{a}, \bar{b}] = \bar{c}, \bar{c}^2 = \bar{a}^{-4}, [\bar{c}, \bar{a}] = 1, [\bar{c}, \bar{b}] = (\bar{c})^{-2} \rangle$  and  $N = \langle x \rangle$ . Then

$$G = \langle a, b \mid a^{2^n} = x^i, b^2 = a^{2^{n-1}}x^j, [a, b] = cx^k, c^2 = a^{-4}x^l, [c, a] = x^s, [c, b] = c^{-2}x^t \rangle,$$

where  $i, j, k, l, s, t \in \{0, 1\}$ .

By a similar argument as in case 4, we can get  $G' = \langle c \rangle$  and  $x = c^{2^{n-1}} = a^{2^n}$ . Since  $[a^2, b] = [a, b]^2[a, b, a]$  and  $[a^2, b, a^2] = [c, a^2][x^s, a^2] = [c, a]^2 = 1$ , noticing that  $n \geq 3$ , we can get

$$1 = [b^2, b] = [a^{2^{n-1}}x, b] = [(a^2)^{2^{n-2}}, b] = [a^2, b]^{2^{n-2}} = [a, b]^{2^{n-1}} = c^{2^{n-1}},$$

a contradiction. Thus  $G/N$  is not one of groups III(2).

**Case 6**  $\bar{G}$  is one of groups III(3) of Theorem.

Let  $\bar{G} = \langle \bar{a}, \bar{b} \mid \bar{a}^{2^n} = 1, \bar{b}^4 = 1, [\bar{a}, \bar{b}] = \bar{c}, \bar{c}^2 = \bar{a}^{-4}, [\bar{c}, \bar{a}] = 1, [\bar{c}, \bar{b}] = (\bar{c})^{-2} \rangle$  and  $N = \langle x \rangle$ . Then

$$G = \langle a, b \mid a^{2^n} = x^i, b^4 = x^j, [a, b] = cx^k, c^2 = a^{-4}x^l, [c, a] = x^s, [c, b] = c^{-2}x^t \rangle,$$

where  $i, j, k, l, s, t \in \{0, 1\}$ .

We can assume  $k = 0$  by letting  $c_1 = cx^k$ . By a similar argument as in Case 4, we can get  $G' = \langle c \rangle$ , and  $x = c^{2^{n-1}} = a^{2^n}$  and  $s = 0$ .

If  $j = 1$ , that is  $b^4 = x$ , then  $(b^2c^{2^{n-2}})^2 = b^4c^{2^{n-1}}[b^2, c^{2^{n-2}}] = x^2 = 1$ . It follows that  $\langle b^2c^{2^{n-2}} \rangle \cap G' = 1$ . Notice that  $\langle b^2c^{2^{n-2}} \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ , by Lemma 2.5(3), we get  $\langle b^2c^{2^{n-2}} \rangle \leq Z(G)$ . By computation,

$$1 = [b^2c^{2^{n-2}}, b] = [c, b]^{2^{n-2}} = c^{-2^{n-1}},$$

a contradiction. Thus  $j = 0$ , that is  $b^4 = 1$ .

Since  $\langle b^2 \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$  and  $\langle b^2 \rangle \cap G' = 1$ , by Lemma 2.5(3), we get  $\langle b^2 \rangle \leq Z(G)$ . Thus  $1 = [a, b^2] = [a, b]^2[a, b, b] = c^2[c, b] = c^2c^{-2}x^t = x^t$ . It follows that  $t = 0$ .

If  $l = 1$ , that is  $c^2 = a^{-4}a^{2^n}$ , then  $(ca^{2^{n-1}+2})^2 = c^2a^{2^n+2^2} = 1$ . It follows that  $\langle ca^{2^{n-1}+2} \rangle \cap G' = 1$ . Notice that  $\langle ca^{2^{n-1}+2} \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ , by Lemma 2.5(3), we get  $\langle ca^{2^{n-1}+2} \rangle \leq Z(G)$ . Thus  $[ca^{2^{n-1}+2}, a] = [ca^{2^{n-1}+2}, b] = 1$ . By computation, we get

$$1 = [ca^{2^{n-1}+2}, a] = [c, a]$$

and so

$$1 = [ca^{2^{n-1}+2}, b] = [c, b][a^2, b]^{2^{n-2}+1} = c^{-2}x^t(c^2)^{2^{n-2}+1} = x^tc^{2^{n-1}}.$$

This implies that  $t = 1$ , a contradiction. Thus  $l = 0$  and  $G$  is one of groups III(3).

**Case 7**  $\bar{G}$  is one of groups IV(1) of Theorem.

Let  $\bar{G} = \langle \bar{a}, \bar{b} \mid \bar{a}^{2^n} = 1, \bar{b}^4 = 1, [\bar{a}, \bar{b}] = \bar{a}^{-2} \rangle$  and  $N = \langle x \rangle$ . Then

$$G = \langle a, b \mid a^{2^n} = x^i, b^4 = x^j, [a, b] = a^{-2}x^k \rangle, \text{ where } i, j, k \in \{0, 1\}.$$

By Lemma 2.5(2), we get  $G'$  is cyclic. Notice that  $\bar{G}' = \langle \bar{a} \rangle$ , then  $G' = \langle a, x \rangle = \langle a \rangle$ . It follows that  $i = 1$ , that is  $x = a^{2^n}$ .

If  $j = 1$ , then  $(b^2a^{-2^{n-1}})^2 = b^4a^{-2^n} = 1$ . It follows that  $\langle b^2a^{-2^{n-1}} \rangle \cap G' = 1$ . Notice that  $\langle b^2a^{-2^{n-1}} \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ , by Lemma 2.5(3), we get  $\langle b^2a^{-2^{n-1}} \rangle \leq Z(G)$ . So  $1 = [b^2a^{-2^{n-1}}, b] = [a^{-2^{n-1}}, b] = [a, b]^{-2^{n-1}} = a^{2^n} \neq 1$ , a contradiction. Thus  $j = 0$ .

If  $k = 0$ , then  $G$  is one of groups IV(1). If  $k = 1$ , then  $G$  is one of groups IV(2).

**Case 8**  $\bar{G}$  is one of groups IV(2) of Theorem.

Let  $\bar{G} = \langle \bar{a}, \bar{b} \mid \bar{a}^{2^n} = 1, \bar{b}^4 = 1, [\bar{a}, \bar{b}] = \bar{a}^{-2+2^{n-1}} \rangle$  and  $N = \langle x \rangle$ . Then

$$G = \langle a, b \mid a^{2^n} = x^i, b^4 = x^j, [a, b] = a^{-2+2^{n-1}}x^k \rangle, \text{ where } i, j, k \in \{0, 1\}.$$

By a similar argument as in Case 7, we can get  $x = a^{2^n}$  and  $b^4 = 1$ . It follows that  $\langle b^2 \rangle \cap G' = 1$ . Notice that  $\langle b^2 \rangle \leq \Phi(G)$ , by Lemma 2.5(3), we get  $\langle b^2 \rangle \leq Z(G)$ . Since  $n \geq 3$ , by computation, we get

$$[a, b^2] = [a, b]^2[a, b, b] = [a, b]^2[a^{-2+2^{n-1}}, b] = [a, b]^2[a, b]^{-2+2^{n-1}} = [a, b]^{2^{n-1}} = a^{2^n} \neq 1,$$

a contradiction too. Thus  $G/N$  is not one of groups IV(2).

Conversely, if  $G$  is one of the groups in the Theorem, we can get easily  $G$  is a  $\mathcal{C}_c$ -group by Lemmas 2.6 and 2.4(3).

The proof is completed.  $\square$

**Acknowledgements** We thank the referees for their time and comments.

## References

- [1] Heng LV, Wei ZHOU, Dapeng YU. *Some finite  $p$ -groups with bounded index of every cyclic subgroup in its normal closure*. J. Algebra, 2011, **338**: 169–179.
- [2] Heng LV, Wei ZHOU, Xiuyun GUO. *Finite 2-groups with index of every cyclic subgroup in its normal closure no greater than 4*. J. Algebra, 2011, **342**: 256–264.
- [3] Heng LV, Wei ZHOU, Xiuyun GUO. *Finite groups with small normal closure of cyclic subgroups*. Comm. Algebra, 2014, **11**(42): 4984–4996.
- [4] Z. JANKO. *Some peculiar minimal situations by finite  $p$ -groups*. Glas. Mat. Ser. III, 2008, **43**(1): 111–120.
- [5] Libo ZHAO, Xiuyun GUO. *Finite  $p$ -groups in which the normal closures of the nonnormal cyclic subgroups have small index*. J. Algebra Appl., 2014, **13**(2): 1–7.
- [6] Z. JANKO. *Finite  $p$ -groups with a uniqueness condition for nonnormal subgroups*. Glas. Mat. Ser. III, 2005, **40**(2): 235–240.
- [7] Y. BERKOVICH. *Groups of Prime Power Order (I)*. Walter de Gruyter, Berlin, 2008.
- [8] L. RÉDEI. *Das “schiefe Produkt” in der Gruppentheorie mit Anwendung auf die endlichen nichtkommutativen Gruppen mit lauter kommutativen echten Untergruppen und die Ordnungszahlen, zu denen nur kommutative Gruppen geh”oren*. Comm. Math. Helv., 1947, **20**: 225–264. (in German)
- [9] D. S. PASSMAN. *Nonnormal subgroups of  $p$ -groups*. J. Algebra, 1970, **15**(3): 352–370.
- [10] Y. BERKOVICH. *Short proofs of some basic characterization theorems of finite  $p$ -group theory*. Glas. Mat. Ser. III, 2006, **41**(2): 239–258.